



centre for **democratic** institutions



INSTITUTE FOR PEACE AND DEMOCRACY

Electoral System Choices for Fiji

Program

Bali, Indonesia

November 2012

A CDI workshop supported by IPD

Introduction and Objectives

In an announcement dated 9 March 2012 and dealing with plans to formulate a new constitution, Fiji's interim Prime Minister outlined a consultation process involving both a Constitutional Commission and a Constituent Assembly, and emphasised that the process would be "guided by universally recognized principles and values that are non-negotiable", including, among other things:

- "A common and equal citizenry";
- "Elimination of discrimination";
- "One person, one vote, one value";
- "The elimination of ethnic voting"; and
- "Proportional representation".

The announcement also indicated that elections are scheduled for 2014.

Within Fiji, with its Westminster tradition of using a plurality ("first-past-the-post") system (1970-87), a mixed block voting system (1992-94) and the alternative vote (1999-2006), there is no experience of the different types of proportional representation (PR) systems.

Indonesia, by contrast, has recent experience with both "closed list" and "open list" PR, with the management of electoral rules designed to strengthen larger parties, and with a transition from military-influenced rule to democracy.

Objectives

The primary goal of the workshop is to provide participants with a sound understanding of the main types of electoral systems in use throughout the Asia-Pacific region and internationally, including proportional representation. In pursuit of that goal, the workshop is configured to:

- introduce participants to **the main types and features of electoral systems**;
- provide insights into **techniques for analysing** different aspects of electoral systems;
- identify some **key policy issues** surrounding the choice of an electoral system; and
- highlight the **political dimensions of electoral policy and electoral system choice**, in both the short and long term.

Information on workshop content is provided in the accompanying document, *Electoral System Choices for Fiji – Workshop Outline*.

Background

The appropriate electoral system for Fiji has been the subject of extensive (and often fierce) public, political and scholarly debate over the last two decades. The 1996 Report of the Fiji Constitution Review Commission (1996), *The Fiji Islands – Towards a United Future*, devoted some 61 pages to the issue of parliamentary elections. A large

literature has arisen from that Report, from the electoral policy choices made in response to it, and from their impact at the elections which followed.

CDI has been observing developments in Fiji over recent years and has concluded that there is now an opportunity to provide support for participants in the emerging discussion about electoral systems in the country. The workshop has been designed so as not to favour any particular choice of electoral system, but simply as a resource for participants who are engaged in the consultation process.

The workshop will present international experience with electoral systems and their political effects. Because of Indonesia's considerable experience over the last 13 years in the use of different electoral systems in support of a transition to and consolidation of democracy, CDI will hold the workshop in Bali, in partnership with the Institute for Peace and Democracy (IPD). In addition to promoting opportunities for effective south-south dialogue, hosting the workshop in Bali allows for separate and parallel discussions to those taking place in Fiji.

A key reference document for the workshop will be International IDEA, *Electoral System Design: The New International IDEA Handbook*, Stockholm, 2005. A copy will be available for workshop participants and is available as a free download from the International IDEA website.

Indonesian Experience

Indonesia is now the world's third largest democracy. The country stands out for the success of its transition from thirty years of dictatorship to a system that has now seen three peaceful changes of government at the ballot box.

Indonesian national elections take place in a context which is both politically and administratively complex. Polling is spread across thousands of islands, with around 519,000 polling stations and over 171 million registered voters. In the 1999, 2004 and 2009 elections, additional elections for provincial and district parliaments were held concurrently with those for the National Parliament.

Since 1999, three different versions of list proportional representation have been used for the National Parliament ("People's Representative Council" or "DPR") elections held in 1999, 2004, and 2009.

Indonesia has a presidential system of government, but the first post-Suharto Presidents were elected indirectly through the Parliament. Since constitutional reforms in 2003, the President has been directly elected in polls held in 2004 and 2009, scheduled to follow each national parliamentary election.

Indonesia's elections are contested by a large number of parties and candidates. Against such a background, any choice of electoral system must take due account not only of desirable representational properties, but also of the need for the system to be capable of being implemented in practice.

Panel Discussion

Because of Indonesia's considerable experience over the last 13 years in the use of different electoral systems in support of a transition to and consolidation of democracy, a panel discussion has been included in which the issues could be canvassed in detail. The panel discussion will take place on the second day of the workshop, Tuesday 20 November.

For the case study on list PR in Indonesia, the reference will be Stephen Sherlock, *Indonesia's 2009 Elections: The New Electoral System and the Competing Parties* (CDI Policy Papers on Political Governance 2009/01), which is available through the CDI website.

The panel discussion serves to shine a light on the constitutional and political, representational and practical implications of the various systems which Indonesia has used since 1999. Experts from IPD, KPU and academia will be available to answer questions from course participants on these issues.

KPU office visit

A visit to the Bali office of the KPU has been scheduled for the afternoon of Wednesday, 21st November. Following the panel discussion, course participants will have an opportunity to talk with staff about the practical considerations of running elections.

List of Participants

Individuals from Fiji who are actively involved in political discourse around the subject of electoral system choices have been invited to participate in this course. CDI and IPD are pleased to welcome the following course participants.

Attar Singh	Priscilla Singh
Father David Arms	Rajendra Chaudhry
Jese Sikivou	Robin Irwin
Kamlesh Arya	Rodney Yee
Kesaia Seniloli	Sitiveni Rabuka
Krishna Datt	Adi Sivia Qoro
Mick Beddoes	Tura Lewai
Monica Raghwan	Udit Narayan
Netani Rika	Virisila Buadromo
Niko Nawaikula	Willie Kwansing

Workshop Materials

Electoral System Choices for Fiji - Workshop Outline (also sent prior to departure)

Electoral System Choices for Fiji - Workshop Notes

Electoral System Design: The New International IDEA Handbook, International IDEA Stockholm, 2005

Practical Exercise 2.1

Solution to Practical Exercise 2.1

Practical Exercise 3.1

Solution to Practical Exercise 3.1

Handout 5.1

Ballot Pack 1 - 6

Sorting Cards for Ballot Packs 1 to 5

Sorting Cards for Ballot Pack 6

PowerPoint - Session 1 - -8

USB stick with electronic copies of all materials

Monday, November 19

<i>Time</i>	<i>Event</i>	<i>People</i>
Breakfast included		
8.45 - 10.00	Arjuna Meeting Room, Novotel Nusa Dua. Welcome Introductory Activity	Ketut Erawan & Stephen Sherlock Thérèse Laanela
10.00 - 10.30 Coffee break		
10.30 - 12.00	<i>Topic 1, part 1</i> Overview of content for the week Defining an electoral system & filling a vacancy	Michael Maley
12.00 - 1.00 Lunch break		
1.00 - 2.00	<i>Topic 1, part 2</i> Including hands on activity on Borda/AV/Condorcet.	Michael Maley & Thérèse Laanela
2.00 - 3.00	<i>Topic 2, part 1</i> Electing a representative body - Single member constituency elections	Jon Fraenkel
3.00 - 3.30 Afternoon tea		
3.30 - 5.00	<i>Topic 2, part 2</i> Including a BD individual, with exercise.	Jon Fraenkel & Thérèse Laanela
Dinner, own arrangements		

Tuesday, November 20

<i>Time</i>	<i>Event</i>	<i>People</i>
Breakfast included		
8.45 - 9.00	Recap & parking lot, introduction of the day.	Thérèse Laanela
9.00 - 10.30	<i>Topic 3, part 1</i> Multiple vacancy elections with counting exercises.	Michael Maley & Thérèse Laanela
10.30 - 11.00 Coffee break		
11.00 - 12.30	<i>Topic 3, part 2</i> Multiple vacancy elections with counting exercises.	Michael Maley & Thérèse Laanela
12.30 - 1.30 Lunch break		
1.30 - 3.00	<i>Topic 4</i> Case Study - Indonesia	Stephen Sherlock
	<i>Panel Discussion</i> Chair: Ketut Erawan	Ketut Erawan
	Q&A	Stephen Sherlock
3.00 - 3.30 Afternoon tea		
3.30 - 5.00	<i>Topic 5</i> Mock Election Single transferable vote (STV) and its variants	Jon Fraenkel & Michael Maley
7.00	<i>Workshop Official Dinner</i> An official dinner for course participants, staff, partners from Indonesia and guests. Dress code for the dinner is smart casual. Where: Flamboyant Room, Novotel Nusa Dua	Grace & Novotel

Wednesday, November 21

<i>Time</i>	<i>Event</i>	<i>People</i>
Breakfast included		
8.45 - 10.030	Recap <i>Topic 6</i> Mixed Systems Introductory Activity Chalk and Talk	Michael Maley & Thérèse Laanela
10.30 - 11.00 Coffee break		
11.00 - 12.30	<i>Topic 7</i> Political Consequences of ESD Activity: Limited Vote – 3 most important	Jon Fraenkel & Thérèse Laanela
12.30 - 1.15 Lunch		
1.15 - 2.30	Travel to KPU office	Grace Hutasoit
2.30 - 4.30	<i>Visit to KPU Bali office</i>	Grace Hutasoit & Sarah Jones
4.30 – 6.00	Return to hotel	Grace Hutasoit & Sarah Jones
Dinner, own arrangements		

Thursday, November 22

<i>Time</i>	<i>Event</i>	<i>People</i>
Breakfast included		
	For flights departing after 5pm, a late checkout to 6pm has been arranged.	Novotel
9.15 - 10.00	Recap of week <i>Topic 8</i> Practical Issues in electoral system design	Thérèse Laanela
10.00 – 10.30 Morning tea		
10.30 - 12.00	Closing Session	Thérèse Laanela
12.00 – 1.00 Lunch		
1.00 – 3.00	Extra time for workshop overrun OR Free time	Michael Maley
3.00 – 3.30 Afternoon tea		
6.00	Check out by 6pm for Fiji flights	Course Participants
	Transfers to airport, Denpasar.	Novotel

Workshop Facilitators



Dr Stephen Sherlock, CDI Director

Dr Stephen Sherlock holds a PhD and MA in South and Southeast Asian history and politics from the University of Sydney. His interests are in Southeast Asian politics and history, especially the political economy of development, political parties, electoral systems and parliaments in Indonesia. He has published extensively on Indonesian legislatures, electoral and political affairs and governance.

Dr Sherlock entered the Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID) as a graduate recruit in 1990, after having taught Asian Studies on a part-time basis while completing postgraduate studies. He subsequently joined the parliamentary service and worked for 11 years as an analyst on Indonesia, East Timor and the Pacific, providing research, analysis and policy advice to MPs and parliamentary committees and producing publications on political developments in the region.

Dr Sherlock left the parliament in 2001 to become an independent consultant. He was contracted by a wide range of Australian and international organisations on projects involving research and analysis, training and seminars, project appraisal, development, implementation and evaluation.

Having taken up the position of Director of CDI in June 2010, Dr Sherlock continues to pursue research and publication on politics, governance and political change in Indonesia.



Dr Ketut Erawan, IPD Executive Director

Dr Erawan is the Executive Director of the Institute for Peace and Democracy at Udayana University in Bali. Dr Erawan is also a member of the Steering Committee for the Australia Indonesia Governance Research Partnership (AIGRP), and from 2004-08 he was the Director of the Post graduate program in Political Science at Gadjah Mada University in Yogyakarta. Dr Erawan holds a PhD in political science from Northern Illinois University, USA, and his research interests include comparative politics, public policy, political parties, elections, and the political economy of South East Asian countries. Recent publications include “Building Models of Party Transformation in Indonesia”, co-authored with Jaka Tri Widaryanto and Nur Azizah, and “Tracing Decentralization Process in Indonesia”.



Michael Maley, Workshop Convenor and CDI Associate

Michael Maley spent more than 30 years as an election administrator before giving up full-time work in January 2012. A specialist on electoral systems, he has done extensive work internationally, serving with UN missions in Namibia, Cambodia, South Africa and East Timor; taking part in UN survey missions in Western Sahara and Eastern Slavonia; and also working at UN Headquarters, and for the Commonwealth Secretariat, the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance, the International Foundation for Electoral Systems, and the Centre for Democratic Institutions. He was an observer at Indonesian elections in 1999, 2004 and 2009, holds a Master’s degree in Political Science and a Graduate Diploma in Statistics from the Australian National University, and has written and lectured extensively on elections and electoral administration.



Thérèse Pearce Laanela, Workshop Facilitator

Thérèse Pearce Laanela is an elections specialist with 20 years of experience in the field of democracy and governance, primarily with international organizations at the field, headquarters and policy level. Assignments in 2012 have included an evaluation of 20 years of UNDP electoral assistance, and, for IDEA, supporting the Mongolian presidency of the Community of Democracies organising a large event on electoral challenges in young democracies. She served as Senior Programme Officer on electoral issues at

International IDEA (1995-2006) and as Assistant Director for the Democracy Program at The Carter Center (2009-2011). Through IFES and IDEA, she has been deeply involved in the development of a variety of seminal publications, networks, databases and training curriculum on electoral administration, including the ACE Electoral Knowledge Network and the BRIDGE course package. Prior to working at IDEA she served in 1994 through UNDP, for the National Electoral Commission in Mozambique organising the first post-war elections, and in Cambodia in 1992-93 as a District Electoral Supervisor for the UN sponsored first multi-party election. She has consistently served as a presiding officer in Swedish elections and has done numerous international election observer and electoral assistance missions in Africa, Europe, and Asia for organisations such as the OSCE, the European Union, and the Carter Center. Her education was in Oriental Languages and East Asian Studies, and her Masters Thesis at the University of Stockholm was about the Japanese Electoral System and Political Financing. Ms Laanela has Canadian, Estonian and Swedish nationalities and has recently relocated to Australia with her family.



Professor Jon Fraenkel, Workshop Facilitator

Jon Fraenkel is a Professor in Comparative Politics in the School of History, Philosophy, Political Science and International Relations at Victoria University of Wellington. He formerly worked at the Australian National University (2007-12) and the University of the South Pacific in Fiji (1995-2007). He is author of *The Manipulation of Custom; from uprising to intervention in the Solomon Islands* (2004) and co-edited *The 2006 Military*

Takeover in Fiji; A coup to end all coups? (2009). His research focuses contemporary Pacific politics, electoral systems, ethnic politics, clientelism, women's representation, and the economic history of Oceania. He has served as an international observer at elections in Fiji, Solomon Islands, and Tonga, and is *The Economist's* Pacific Island correspondent.



Grace Hutasoit, CDI Program and Research Officer

Grace holds a Bachelor of Political Science from the University of Parahyangan and was awarded an Australian Development Scholarship to continue her postgraduate study with a Master of International Relations at the University of Melbourne. Prior to joining CDI, she has worked at the EU-ASEAN Aceh Monitoring Mission, British Embassy, and Australian Embassy in Jakarta, with a focus on political communications and diplomacy.



Sarah Jones, IPD Organisational Development Advisor

Sarah has a Bachelor of Arts (Development Studies) with Honours from the Australian National University. Her expertise in project management for the development sector has been developed through in-country experience in Zimbabwe, East Timor and Indonesia. She has consistently been involved in the development and preparation and writing of tender and proposal documentation for the purpose of securing project funding, including undertaking sector specific research. Her experience has seen her involved in all aspects of international project implementation for a number of large donor-funded projects.

Centre for Democratic Institutions

The ***Centre for Democratic Institutions*** (www.cdi.anu.edu.au) is an Australian government-funded body that supports the efforts of new democracies in the Asia-Pacific region to strengthen their political systems. It provides training, technical assistance and peer support for parliamentarians and emerging leaders in Southeast Asia and the South Pacific, with a particular focus on Indonesia, East Timor, Papua New Guinea, Solomon Islands, Vanuatu and Fiji.

CDI's well-established knowledge base and network of expertise in the area of electoral systems is used as a basis to provide high quality analytical information to workshop participants, who are involved in the current discussions and consultations in Fiji. CDI is thus contributing to informed debate and, potentially, to a better political outcome for the country.

Institute for Peace and Democracy

The ***Institute for Peace and Democracy*** (www.instituteforpeaceanddemocracy.org) was established to implement the agenda of the Bali Democracy Forum between annual meetings. IPD focuses on the practical implementation of democracy, its systems, processes and stakeholders, and supports the various groups who are actively engaged in advancing democracy. These include government officials, civil society leaders, the media and academics. IPD uses a range of methods to deliver on its aims including training and education, workshops, joint missions, electoral monitoring, network building, research and publications.

Komisi Pemilihan Umum (KPU)

The Indonesian Komisi Pemilihan Umum (The General Elections Commission) is responsible for running both parliamentary and presidential elections in Indonesia. Prior to the General Election of 2004, the KPU was made up of members who were also

members of political parties, however members of the KPU must now be non-partisan. KPU's main role includes the planning and preparation of elections; determining political parties' eligibility to run in elections; and to lead each stage of the election process. Regional KPU offices have the same role but they are responsible for conducting elections only in their respective regions.